



**BOISE CITY HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
HEARING MINUTES
JULY 22, 2019**

I. CALL TO ORDER

PRESENT: Shallat, Richter, Weaver, Montoto, Rupp, Moroney
ABSENT: Valderrama-Echavarria, Koski

II. MINUTES

1. Work Session Minutes | May 20, 2019
2. Hearing Minutes | May 20, 2019

RESULT:	ACCEPTED [UNANIMOUS]
MOVER:	Jillian Moroney, Commissioner
SECONDER:	Noah Richter, Commissioner
AYES:	Shallat, Richter, Weaver, Montoto, Rupp, Moroney
ABSENT:	Carolina Valderrama-Echavarria, Devin Koski

WITHDRAWN

1. **DRH19-00199 / Matthew Winkley / 1118 W. Fort Street**
Certificate of Appropriateness request to keep previously installed vinyl windows and to cover the exterior with metal cladding on property located in an R-2HD (Medium Density Residential with Historic Design Review overlay) zone.

RESULT:	WITHDRAWN
----------------	------------------

IV. CONSENT AGENDA

2. **DRH19-00204 / Clarence Pond / 1501 W. Irene Street**
Certificate of Appropriateness request to demolish an existing one-car garage and construct a one-story, two-car garage with attached accessory dwelling unit. The project site is located in an R-1CH (Single-family Residential with Historic overlay) zone.

3. **DRH19-00211 / Zachary Smith / 2718 W. Lemp Street**
Certificate of Appropriateness request to demolish an existing garage and construct a two-story garage with accessory dwelling unit above. The project site is located in an R-1CH (Single-family Residential with Historic overlay) zone.

6. **DRH19-00270 / Abby Baggs / 1317 N. 12th Street**
Certificate of Appropriateness request to demolish a non-contributing single-family structure and detached garage and to construct a single-family structure with detached garage and associated site improvements, in an R-1CH (Single-family Residential with Historic overlay) zone.

RESULT:	APPROVED [UNANIMOUS]
MOVER:	Cindy Montoto, Chair
SECONDER:	Danielle Weaver, Commissioner
AYES:	Shallat, Richter, Weaver, Montoto, Rupp, Moroney
ABSENT:	Carolina Valderrama-Echavarria, Devin Koski

V. NEW BUSINESS

4. **DRH19-00222 / Richard Fix / 2142 N. 15th Street**
Certificate of Appropriateness request to demolish an existing garage and construct a two-story garage with accessory dwelling unit above. The project site is located in an R-1CH (Single-family Residential with Historic overlay) zone.

Commissioner Richter: Shared concern with peak height and massing of garages exceeding peak height and massing of homes within Historic Districts due to the guideline that garages shall stay subordinate to the home.

Commissioner Moroney: Appreciates how much thought went into the design of the garage to mimic the aesthetics of the main house.

Commissioner Weaver: Agreed with Commissioner Richter that she does not like to see a garage taller than a house and feels they should be smaller and shorter. Feels this is a unique scenario which makes it harder to hold a hard line in the fact it has support from the neighbors and the garage is on a large lot, setback from the house and appears to be only one-foot taller.

RESULT:	APPROVED [5 TO 1]
MOVER:	Ericka Rupp, Commissioner
SECONDER:	Anthony Shallat, Commissioner
AYES:	Shallat, Weaver, Montoto, Rupp, Moroney
NAYS:	Noah Richter
ABSENT:	Carolina Valderrama-Echavarria, Devin Koski

5. **DRH19-00223 / Kristy Newkirk / 1014 E. Washington Street**

Certificate of Appropriateness request to demolish a non-contributing single-family structure and detached garage and construct a single-family structure with detached garage and associated site improvements, in an R-1CH (Single-family Residential with Historic overlay) zone.

David Casey (Applicant): Stated they would like to build in a mid-century style with wood and brick on the front. The home is planned to be a modest, tight and energy efficient. They hope in 50 years that it will become contributing.

Cindy Casey (Applicant): Added as homeowners they are proud to live in the East End, have lived in the home for 12 years and this is their forever home. Extended family also lives in the neighborhood.

Hans Glenn (4557 Waterford): Spoke on architecture adding the main goal was to take elements of existing home and follow the elements of the other structures/homes of the neighborhood by keeping the pitch low and not bringing in a large mass.

Greg Ostrow (President | East End Neighborhood Association): President for two months. Stated applicants did reach out to EENA and made modifications to the project based on some of the board's concerns. Board does not have any objections to the proposed project, but asked the following be included on record:

1. EENA generally not in support of tear-downs. Some education for the board on complete tear downs of non-contributing homes in historic districts may help so they don't spend time off the record not knowing what they're doing.
2. For exterior design, the board defers to the Commission to maintain the character of the historic district as they are not historic preservationist.

Commissioner Richter: Thanked the applicants for being sensitive in their design, use of materials and processes used to build the home.

Commissioner Rupp: Appreciates the applicant wants to ensure that what they build if evaluated in the future would be looked at as a contributing home.

RESULT:	APPROVED [UNANIMOUS]
MOVER:	Noah Richter, Commissioner
SECONDER:	Ericka Rupp, Commissioner
AYES:	Shallat, Richter, Weaver, Montoto, Rupp, Moroney
ABSENT:	Carolina Valderrama-Echavarria, Devin Koski

VI. ADJOURNMENT